Annotated bibliography of print resources on reviewing journal articles

A “How to” for reviewing papers for a journal. May also be of interest for readers (to evaluate the worth of a particular paper) or writers (to consider what referees may be thinking).


- The activity below is from this paper, and was originally adapted from the Smith paper referenced above.

*Ask students to review papers assigned from the literature. These papers must be carefully selected both to teach up-to-date information about the topic of the course, as well as to provide examples of both good and not-so-good work. For each paper, or for a small group of papers that may all discuss a related point, students are asked to write a short (1-2 page) summary that addresses each of the following points, and/or discuss these points as a class:*

1. What is the problem being studied?
2. Is this an important problem? Why or why not?
3. What are the main results?
4. What method is used to produce the results?
5. What are the assumptions in the paper? How realistic are they?
6. How sensitive are the results to the assumptions?
7. What did you learn from this paper?
8. Describe the similarities and differences of this paper compared to other related papers.